

## Social Psychology Quarterly

MS #: 06-048

Title: Adolescent Girls' Race/ethnic Status, Identities, Drive for Thinness  
Reviewer A

This manuscript, which explores ethnicity, identities, drive for thinness and other contextual and individual factors among adolescents, presents an interesting and potentially important area of study. As the authors note, girls' bodies are social constructs and reflect aspects of their identities and their socio-cultural contexts. Thus, this research could have valuable implications for understanding how a young girl's body image is constructed and ways to promote improved self-concept and well-being among female adolescents. However, the potential significance of this work is lost in the lack of cohesiveness of the theoretical approach, the poor organization and writing of the manuscript, and the lack of clarity about the proposed hypotheses.

### 1. Introduction/Theory

My primary concern is that this study does not present a clear theoretical rationale for the analyses conducted. Although multiple theoretical foundations are mentioned, these theories are poorly integrated. Moreover, the wordiness, repetitiveness, and jargon in the introduction detract greatly from the paper and make it quite difficult to read. The flow of the "story" is lost amongst the quotes, language, and ideas of other theorists. Despite the exploratory nature of the analyses, there is ample opportunity for the authors to build on and extend past theory, to inject original thought into the introduction, and clearly speculate (hypothesize) about the relationships they expect to see. In addition, although the title suggests that culture (ethnicity/race) provides the key cornerstone to this paper, culture is reduced to a categorical variable without texture and with minimal depth, both in the introduction (theory) and in the methodology. Overall, the general writing (e.g., sentence structure, grammar, flow) of the introduction needs a significant amount of work.

### 2. Method/Data Analyses

The method and data analytic sections are sufficiently organized and clear. I applaud the use of a large nationally representative dataset to explore issues of weight, self-perceptions, and dieting strategies and am gratified to see that there is a focus on ethnicity. Together, these constructs are greatly understudied. Although the analyses are descriptive in nature, which I find to be of modest value, my primary objection goes back to the lack of proposed hypotheses (the missing link from theory to data analyses). A study can be descriptive, such as this one, but still present a clear picture/story based on what the authors expect to see and why. This weakness is reflected in the authors' decision to treat race/ethnicity as completely separate from the contextual and social factors (with limited explanation of how these all may relate). This seems entirely inconsistent with the purported focus on identity and culture. For instance, is family context really orthogonal from one's ethnicity and cultural background?

### 3. Results/Discussion

The results section would benefit from a priori hypotheses to organize the presentation of findings. The discussion section is weak and reiterates much of what is said in the introduction; however, this is most likely a direct result of the overall lack of clear hypotheses and theoretical integration.

### 4. In General:

A large amount of exploratory, descriptive data is presented in this manuscript. The authors might consider breaking this paper up into two or more papers, with different foci, if this approach helps them to develop a stronger theoretical framework. Alternatively, if kept as one paper, this manuscript requires substantial reorganization and revision, particularly in the introduction and conclusion.